

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO
THE GOVERNING COUNCIL
REPORT NUMBER 196 OF THE COMMITTEE ON
ACADEMIC POLICY AND PROGRAMS

April 2, 2019

To the Academic Board,
University of Toronto

Your Committee reports that it met on Tuesday, April 2, 2019 at 4:10 p.m. in the Council Chamber, Simcoe Hall, with the following present:

Present:

Ernest Lam (Chair)
Markus Stock (Vice-Chair)
Susan McCahan,
Donald Ainslie
Catherine Amara
Aarthi Ashok
Emily Chu
James Davis
Connie Guberman
Mallory Jackman
William Ju
Shawn Medeiros
Jan Mahrt-Smith
Paul Malozewski
Mohan Matthen
Nicholas Moroz
Sandhya Mylabathula
Emmanuel Nikiema
Said Sidani

Regrets:

Zhong-Ping Feng
Jason Glover
Jeannie Kim
Richard Levin
Richard Sommer
Rachel Zand

Secretariat

David Walders

In Attendance:

Raviraj Adve, Associate Chair, Undergraduate, The Edward S. Rogers Sr. Department of Electrical and Computer Engineering, Faculty of Applied Science & Engineering
Julie Audet, Vice-Dean, Graduate Studies, Faculty of Applied Science & Engineering
Sandra Bamford, Acting Director, Centre for French and Linguistics, UTSC
Ronald Beiner, Chair, Department of Political Science, Faculty of Arts & Science
Heather Boon, Vice-Provost, Faculty & Academic Life
Randy Boyagoda, Principal, St. Michael's College
David Cameron, Dean, Faculty of Arts & Science
Alison Chasteen, Chair, Graduate Program, Department of Psychology, Faculty of Arts & Science
Corinn Columpar, Director, Cinema Studies Institute, Faculty of Arts & Science
Ettore Damiano, Chair, Department of Economics, Faculty of Arts & Science
Amrita Daniere, Vice-Principal Academic and Dean, UTM
Richard J. DiFrancesco, Chair, Department of Geography and Planning, Faculty of Arts & Science
Justine Garrett, Coordinator, Academic Planning & Reviews, Office of the Vice-Provost, Academic Programs
Rafael Gomez, Director, Centre for Industrial Relations and Human Resources, Faculty of Arts & Science

Gillian Hamilton, Associate Chair, Undergraduate, Department of Economics, Faculty of Arts & Science
Jane E. Harrison, Director, Office of the Vice-Provost, Faculty and Academic Life
Allan Kaplan, Vice Dean, Graduate and Academic Affairs, Faculty of Medicine
Marten van Kerkwijk, Undergraduate Associate Chair, Department of Astronomy and Astrophysics
Mingyao Liu, Director, Institute of Medical Science, Faculty of Arts & Science
Penelope Lockwood, Vice-Dean, Faculty of Arts & Science
Daniella Mallinick, Director, Academic Programs, Planning and Quality Assurance, Office of the Vice-Provost, Academic Programs
Chris Matzner, Graduate Associate Chair, Department of Astronomy and Astrophysics, Faculty of Arts & Science
Brian Price, Graduate Coordinator, Cinema Studies Institute, Faculty of Arts & Science
Susan Rappolt, Chair, Department of Occupational Science & Occupational Therapy, Faculty of Medicine
Arthur Ripstein, Acting Chair (St. George) and Graduate Chair, Department of Philosophy, Faculty of Arts & Science
Mark Schmuckler, Vice-Dean, Undergraduate, UTSC
Brent Sleep, Department of Civil and Mineral Engineering, Faculty of Applied Science & Engineering
Rinaldo Walcott, Director, Women and Gender Studies Institute, Faculty of Arts & Science
Trevor Young, Dean, Faculty of Medicine

ALL ITEMS ARE REPORTED TO THE ACADEMIC BOARD FOR INFORMATION ONLY.

The Chair welcomed members and guests to the meeting and thanked the Review Groups for their commitment to the important task of conducting their respective reviews.

1. Faculty of Medicine: Guidelines for the Assessment of Teaching Effectiveness in Tenure for Tenure-Stream Faculty and Assessment of Teaching Effectiveness in Continuing Status Decisions and Promotion for Teaching Stream Faculty

Professor Heather Boon provided a brief overview of the revised Guidelines.

There were no questions from members.

On motion duly made, seconded and carried

It was Resolved

THAT the “Guidelines for the Assessment of Teaching Effectiveness in Tenure for Tenure-Stream Faculty and Assessment of Teaching Effectiveness in Continuing Status Decisions and Promotion for Teaching Stream Faculty” approved by the Faculty of Medicine Faculty Council on February 11, 2019, be approved, effective immediately.

2. Follow-Up report on Reviews

a) Celtic Studies programs (Faculty of Arts and Science; housed in St. Michael’s College)

Professor McCahan noted that the follow-up on the Celtic Studies program reported on progress towards the articulation of a clear vision for the program that could lead to strategic and operational sustainability, including the status of any new hires or involvement of cognate faculty.

Professor McCahan highlighted the following points from the follow-up report:

- St. Michaels College, which sponsored the Celtic Studies program for the Faculty of Arts and Science, would continue to direct a combination of endowed and operating funds to support the program.
- The Faculty of Arts and Science would soon confirm a unit-level planning process, following which the program’s academic lead would oversee the development of a unit-level academic plan that would articulate the unit’s key academic plans over the next five-year period.
- The Report also provided an update on hiring and new partnerships with the departments of English and History.

b) Department of Geography and Planning (Faculty of Arts and Science)

Professor McCahan noted that the follow-up for the Department of Geography and Planning reported on the status of the working group and curriculum committee

conversations regarding undergraduate curriculum development and the sustainability of offerings in physical and environmental geography science, including possibilities for collaboration with cognate units.

Professor McCahan highlighted the following points from the follow-up report:

- The Department of Geography and Planning struck three working groups. With the input of these working groups, the Department was considering reimagining physical and environmental geography as a program that focussed on understanding the science underlying contemporary environmental change, with an emphasis on computation.
- The follow-up report described plans for short and long term hiring to support this reimagining.
- In addition, the department Chair had also begun to discuss potential for curricular collaboration with the Chair of the Department of Earth Sciences; they would convene an interdepartmental working group to further explore this collaboration.

c) Department of Biochemistry (Faculty of Medicine)

Professor McCahan reported that the follow-up for the Department of Biochemistry reported on the status of Department's strategic planning, the implementation of the rotation system, and the future of the bioinformatics and computation biology specialist.

Professor McCahan highlighted the following points from the follow-up report:

- The Acting Chair of the Department of Biochemistry implemented a planning session at the Departmental retreat, which will be repeated annually. The Chair would develop a 5-year plan with the assistance of a consultant.
- A rotation system for graduate placements was instituted in September 2017. Since the implementation of the system, students were finding supervisors and projects suited to their interests with greater ease, and no students have needed to be reassigned to new supervisors.
- After lengthy consideration and consultation, the Bioinformatics and Computation Biology (BCB) Specialist was moved to the Department of Cell and Systems Biology in 2018.

There were no questions from members on any of the follow-up reports.

3. Semi-Annual Report on the reviews of Academic Units and Programs

The Chair noted that since the last report to the Committee, the Office of the Vice-President and Provost had received fourteen reviews of units and/or programs, all of which were Decanal, commissioned by the Deans of their respective Divisions. All were brought forth to the Committee for information. The submissions included the signed administrative responses from each Dean, which highlighted action plans in response to reviewer recommendations.

The Chair reported that members had been broken into four reading Groups and that each Group had been assigned reviews to consider. To guide their work, members of these groups were asked to consider three questions:

- i) Does the summary accurately tell the story of the full review?*
- ii) Does the administrative response address all issues identified?*
- iii) Are there any questions, comments or substantive issues that the Committee should consider? Is there need to ask that the Vice-Provost, Academic Programs bring forward a follow-up report?*

The Chair invited Professor McCahan to make general remarks about the reviews.

Professor McCahan reported that her office had examined the fourteen review reports to identify both recurring and new themes: the talent and high calibre of students, the impressive body of scholarship produced by faculty, the excellent quality and interdisciplinary strengths of programs and the many ways that the programs, and therefore students, benefitted from contributions across Faculties and Campuses.

As always, the reviews noted areas for development. The reviews identified the need for units to strengthen their communication and governance structures, and suggested ways to engage in meaningful planning discussions. The reviews also highlighted the need to ensure that diversity is reflected in faculty complement and curriculum.

Institute of Medical Science and its programs, Faculty of Medicine

The spokesperson for the Reading Group reported that the summary accurately captured the points made in the thorough and thoughtful external review. As well, the administrative response provided clear responses to recommendations of the review. The group sought clarity on tracking PhD enrolments as well as the size and function of the executive committee.

Vice-Dean Allan Kaplan reported that PhD students were tracked, and while the entry point numbers may seem low, this was because there was no direct entry to the PhD program. There were around 40 PhD students admitted annually, many transferring from the master's to the doctoral program, a number which had remained constant. Turning to the executive committee, Dean Trevor Young noted a smaller steering committee was being developed which would assume many of the functions of the executive committee.

No follow up report was requested.

Department of Occupational Science and Occupational Therapy and its programs, Faculty of Medicine

The spokesperson for the Reading Group reported that the summary accurately captured the issues raised in the review and that the administrative response thoroughly addressed the main issues that had been identified. The Group did enquire about when the advanced standing option (for practicing therapists to acquire the MScOT degree) would be resumed.

Dean Young replied that resuming the standing option would be examined once the expansion of the program to UTM had been fully implemented and following a review of resources.

No follow-up report was requested.

The Edward S. Rogers St. Department of Electrical and Computer Engineering, Faculty of Applied Science and Engineering

The spokesperson for the Reading Group reported that the summary accurately captured the issues raised in the review and the administrative response addressed many but not all of the points raised in the review.

The Reading Group felt that strategic recommendation concerning changes in the research culture to a more cooperative model, and the recommendation that the department identify areas of priority in which it would provide disciplinary leadership at an international level, were not sufficiently addressed in the administrative response. As well, there were important suggestions for reform of the undergraduate programs, including a change in admissions policy and greater availability of research and internship opportunities that were not mentioned in the response.

Vice-Dean Julie Audet noted that there was transition within the Faculty with the appointment of a new dean, and that these recommendations would be addressed over the next year.

A one-year follow-up report was requested to report on recommended changes within the research culture to a more cooperative model, suggestions that the department identify areas of priority in which it will provide leadership at an international level, and reform of the undergraduate programs.

Department of Civil and Mineral Engineering and its programs, Faculty of Applied Science and Engineering

The spokesperson for the Reading Group reported that the summary covered the full Review and that the Dean's administrative response addressed the issues raised. The Group requested a comment on the plan to address some of the organizational issues in the Department, including the hiring of a Chief Operations Officer (COO).

Professor Brent Sleep replied that a Director of Technical Services had recently been hired, which would fill most of the duties typically performed by a COO.

No follow-up report was requested.

Centre for French and Linguistics and its programs, UTSC

The spokesperson for the Reading Group reported that the summary covered the full Review and that the Dean's administrative response was thorough in addressing the issues raised. The Group enquired about whether the Department was considering the implementation of a pronunciation course.

Vice-Dean Mark Schmuckler noted that, rather than create a stand-alone pronunciation course, which would only serve 20-30 students, it was planned that pronunciation would be

integrated into nearly every class instead. They also planned to increase oral communication within the courses to provide immediate feedback on pronunciation..

No follow-up report was requested.

Department of Political Science and its programs, UTM

The spokesperson for the Reading Group reported that the summary covered the full Review and the administrative response addressed the vast majority of the concerns raised. However, members requested comments on the issues of gender balance in faculty hiring and appropriate preparation of teaching assistants (TAs).

Professor Ronald Beiner, the Chair of the Department, confirmed that the Department was committed to promoting faculty diversity, including in the upcoming searches for two faculty members. With respect to TA preparation, Professor Beiner noted the logistical challenges with requiring TAs from Mississauga to travel to the St. George Campus to attend lectures. Vice Principal Academic & Dean Amrita Danieri noted that the Department was committed to ensuring the TAs were adequately prepared and would be examining a number of options including the possibility of providing TAs with online learning opportunities. She noted that the incoming Chair of the Department had a wealth of experience with online learning strategies.

No follow-up report was requested.

Department of Economics and its programs, Faculty of Arts and Science

The spokesperson for the Reading Group reported that the summary covered the full Review. The Group agreed that the Dean's administrative response addressed the majority of the issues identified. The Group sought clarity on steps being taken to assist PhD students who were also serving as RAs, tracking PhD students' progress, as well as hiring additional female faculty

In reply, Vice-Dean Poppy Lockwood noted that the Department was examining ways in which to provide additional assistance to PhD students conducting research, including assisting with applications for external funding for research. With respect to PhD tracking, Vice-Dean Lockwood noted that the Chair of the Department would be working to ensure that the annual review process, which was already in place, was working effectively.

Finally, regarding gender balance among faculty, Vice-Dean Lockwood noted that the Department was very focussed on increasing its proportion of female faculty and on the promotion of female professors from associate to full professor and had been very successful in its recent searches.

No follow-up request was requested.

The Canadian Institute for Theoretical Astrophysics (CITA), the Dunlap Institute for Astronomy and Astrophysics, and the Department of Astronomy and Astrophysics and its programs, Faculty of Arts and Science

The spokesperson for the Reading Group reported that the summary covered the full Review. The Group agreed that the Dean's administrative response addressed many but not all of the issues identified. In particular, the Group requested additional comment on the lack of computer programming development in undergraduate programs, the need for community building across units, and ways to address low morale among post-doctorates.

In reply, Vice-Dean Lockwood noted that integrating computer programming at the undergraduate level was a priority for the Chair, who was looking into introducing programming, especially in Python at the 200-level, with programming exercises embedded in 300 and 400 level courses.

Turning to community building and low post-doc morale, Vice-Dean Lockwood noted that efforts were being made on both fronts, which included reducing the salary disparity between post-docs at CITA and Dunlap (which had higher salaries on average) and the Department of Astronomy & Astrophysics.

A follow-up report was requested to address issues relating to post-doc morale and community-building across units, notably between the Department and Dunlap.

Graduate Psychology programs, Faculty of Arts and Science

The spokesperson for the Reading Group reported that the summary covered the full Review. The Group agreed that the Dean's administrative response fully addressed the issues identified. One issue that the Group sought additional comment on was the concern raised by graduate students regarding the variety of courses offered and the ability of students to roadmap their degree in advance.

Vice-Dean Lockwood noted that the Chair was focussed on the issues of graduate course scheduling and had implemented a detailed schedule with a 4-year outlook, including who would be teaching the courses. As well, additional courses had been added to the schedule.

No follow-up report was requested.

Cinema Studies Institute and its programs, Faculty of Arts and Science

The spokesperson for the Reading Group reported that the summary covered the full Review. The Group agreed that the Dean's administrative response fully addressed the issues identified. The Group requested additional comment on what steps were being taken to increase diversity in the faculty.

Vice-Dean Lockwood noted that the Director had shown strong leadership in this area, and that female faculty represented almost half of the total complement. Work was being done to ensure that these faculty members had sufficient support to be able to take on leadership roles within the Institute. She noted that it was a Faculty-wide priority to make sure that female faculty were not delayed in promotion from associate professor to full, and that there was a Faculty-wide working group to address this and other equity and diversity issues.

A one-year follow-up report was requested to report on progress made towards increasing Faculty diversity.

Women and Gender Studies Institute and its programs, Faculty of Arts and Science

The spokesperson for the Reading Group reported that the summary covered the full Review. The Group agreed that the Dean's administrative response fully addressed the issues identified. The Group had no specific additional questions or comments.

No follow-up report was requested.

Book and Media Studies program, Faculty of Arts and Science

The spokesperson for the Reading Group reported that the summary covered the full Review and the Group agreed that the Dean's administrative response fully addressed the issues identified. The Group sought clarity on plans for a new faculty cohort (especially in light of planned budget cuts) as well as optimal enrolment for the program.

Vice-Dean Lockwood replied that the Faculty was undertaking an academic planning process and would be making recommendations in the Spring of 2019 to ensure students in college based programs had access to tenure-stream faculty. No reduction in faculty or reduction in faculty support was planned as a result of budgetary considerations. Regarding enrolment, there was an upcoming retreat to examine enrolment but, in general, the program was comfortable with enrolment levels.

No follow-up report was requested.

Department of Philosophy and its programs, Faculty of Arts and Science

The spokesperson for the Reading Group reported that the summary covered the full Review and the Group agreed that the Dean's administrative response fully addressed the issues identified. The Group sought additional comment on increasing 200-level tutorials and whether the planned increase in faculty would result in more full-time faculty teaching 300-level courses.

In reply, Vice-Dean Lockwood noted that an expansion of the Logic Lab within the department was planned, which would provide additional and effective support for students. This approach was seen as more effective at providing additional support than adding tutorials, and the Dean's Office would work with the department to ensure appropriate support was in place. The planned hires would increase the number of full-time faculty teaching 300-level courses.

No follow-up report was requested.

Centre for Industrial Relations and Human Resources and its programs, Faculty of Arts and Science

The spokesperson for the Reading Group reported that the summary covered the full Review and the Group agreed that the Dean's administrative response fully addressed the issues identified. The Group requested additional comment on the way in which students would engage with the process of addressing course overlap as well as professional development opportunities for MA students.

Vice-Dean Lockwood confirmed that the Centre was consulting with the curriculum development specialist from the Office of the Vice-Provost, Innovations in Undergraduate

Education to address the issues of course overlap and engage in curriculum mapping. A working group with student representation would be created to provide guidance on these activities. Regarding professional development for MA students, the Centre was examining a more comprehensive mentoring approach for students as well as tailoring the services provided by the career development professionals to address the unique needs of each student.

No follow-up report was requested.

In the discussion on the reviews overall, members raised two concerns that pertained to many of the reviews: the need for greater involvement of graduate chairs in reviews of units offering undergraduate programs in cognate areas as well as the need for greater diversity among faculty generally.

The Chair thanked the Office of the Vice-Provost, Academic Programs for their work in preparing the review materials.

4. Report of the Previous Meeting: Report 195 – February 26, 2019

The Report of the Previous Meeting was received for information.

5. Business Arising from the Report of the Previous Meeting

There was no business arising out of the Report of the Previous Meeting.

6. Date of Next Meeting

Members were reminded that the date of the next meeting would be held on May 8, 2019 at 4:10 p.m.

7. Reports of the Administrative Assessors

There were no reports from the Administrative Assessors.

8. Other Business

There were no items of other business.

The meeting adjourned at 6:00 p.m.

Secretary

Chair

April 8, 2018